

Alternative Project and Ecovillage Comparison Chart

The Ecovillage and the 191 Unit Pre-Approved Housing Project at a Glance

Approval Process¹	Ecovillage	Pre-Approved Project
Environmental review	yes	no
Requirement to reduce environmental impacts	yes	no
Public hearing process	yes	no
Public architectural design review	yes	no
Agriculture²		
Preservation of agricultural land	yes	yes
Permanently protect agricultural land now zoned for development	yes	no
Increase amount of land now in agricultural use	yes	no
Organic farm	yes	no
Recreation and Open Space³		
Permanently protect forest lands	yes	no
Dedicate hiking trails for public use	yes	no
Create new parks	yes	no
Provide new community/teen center	yes	no
Affordable and Senior Housing⁴		
Meets County affordable housing requirement	yes	yes
Local Preference Housing program	yes	no
Retirement Center	yes	no
Water⁵		
Use of reclaimed water	yes	no
Rainwater harvesting	yes	no
Houses designed and built to conserve water	yes	no
Preserve Conn Creek	yes	no
Energy⁶		

Houses designed and built to conserve energy	yes	no
"Green" building materials	yes	no
Solar power	yes	no
Geothermal energy	yes	no
Transportation⁷		
Shuttle bus program	yes	no
Shared electric cars	yes	no
Bicycle paths	yes	no
Walking paths	yes	no
Transportation Resource Center	yes	no
Public Safety⁸		
Sheriff's substation	yes	no
Contribute financially to the fire department and ambulance service	yes	no
Reduce fire risks	yes	no
Traffic calming on Howell Mountain Road	yes	no
Schools⁹		
Contribute financially to public schools	yes	yes
Contribute financially to private schools	yes	no
Town Center¹⁰		
Preserve existing businesses	yes	yes
Improve grocery store	yes	no
Add some new community-serving goods and services	yes	no
Enhance appearance and functionality of town center	yes	no
Create village square or green	yes	no
Pacific Union College¹¹		
Strengthen PUC curriculum	yes	no
Strengthen PUC financially	yes	no
Provide more student scholarships	yes	no
Increase faculty salaries	yes	no

¹ The 191 unit project is covered by an Environmental Assessment (EA), a simplified form of Environmental Impact Report (EIR), which Napa County conducted in 2006 in connection with the update of its Housing Element. An EA (sometimes called an EIR light) is not subject to circulation and public comment. This EA covers the entire County rather than a specific project. No further project-specific environmental review of the 191 units is required. In contrast, the Ecovillage requires a full-scale EIR, which is currently being prepared by outside experts, and will be subject to extensive public scrutiny.

The County Code (18.82.060) requires the 191 unit project to comply with several very modest mitigation measures identified in the EA. Most of them are generic, meaning that they do not relate to Angwin but apply to all affordable housing projects in the County. In contrast, the EIR currently underway will examine the impacts of the Ecovillage on Angwin, and will recommend extensive and specific mitigation measures with which the Ecovillage will be required to comply.

There will be no architectural or design review of houses to be constructed in the pre-approved project. They might be Tuscan villa, English Tudor, Mexican adobe, or American colonial. In contrast, the Ecovillage has committed to completing all of its architecture in advance, and presenting it to the County and the public for approval. It is taking this extraordinary step, which is not required for project approval, so that the community will know with certainty exactly what the Ecovillage will look like.

² Neither the Ecovillage nor the 191 unit project will result in the loss of land designated by Napa County for agriculture. However, both the Ecovillage and the 191 unit project will result in the loss of current ag production on PD land – land that is not zoned Ag. Only the Ecovillage, however, will actually increase the amount of land being farmed. That is because the Ecovillage includes a 70-acre farm which will supply fresh food to the community. The farm will be certified organic, and is supported by a rigorous business plan to ensure that it operates indefinitely in an economically as well as an environmentally sustainable manner. Easements will be placed on land devoted to the Ecovillage farm, permanently protecting it from non-agricultural uses.

³ The 191 unit project includes no commitment to protecting the forests around Angwin, ensuring public access to that beauty, or expanding recreational opportunities for the community. It does not include a single park, bicycle rack or drinking fountain. In contrast, the Ecovillage proposes three new neighborhood parks and funding for the Community/Teen Center. If the Ecovillage is approved, PUC is prepared to ensure permanent public access to the popular hiking trails on its property via public access easements. It is also prepared to transform nearly 1,500 acres of its property into a Forest Preserve, protecting it forever through conservation easements. These easements will run with the land, and so be binding in perpetuity.

⁴ The Ecovillage includes a 105-unit Retirement Center, which will likely contain both independent and assisted living facilities, and will be conveniently located next to stores and services in the Village Square. The pre-approved project

offers nothing for Angwin's seniors. Napa County needs affordable housing, and has designated Angwin as one of the places it can meet that need. The County requires that at least 10% of the houses in a project must be affordable. The 191 unit project will include 113 affordable units or 60% of the total, which is why it has been pre-approved. The Ecovillage will include 59 affordable units or 15% of the total. Thus, the 191 unit project provides an additional 54 affordable units, but at what cost to the community?

⁵ The pre-approved project makes no commitment and has no obligation to conserve water beyond the minimal standards contained in state law. Water use in Angwin will increase significantly if the 191 unit project is constructed. In contrast, water use in Angwin will not increase as a result of the Ecovillage, which will be a model of water conservation for the nation. The greatest savings will be achieved through the use of recycled water, which will bring to an end the current, wasteful practice of using drinking water to irrigate landscaping. Instead, the existing plant will be upgraded (at the developer's expense) to treat wastewater to an extremely high standard, suitable for irrigation use. Through efficient design, rainwater harvesting and other state of the art techniques, homes in the Ecovillage are expected to use 50% less water than conventional homes of the same size.

⁶ The pre-approved project will not include any use of alternative energy or incorporate any energy-saving innovations. In contrast, the Ecovillage will make extensive use of alternative energy sources, like solar power and ground source heat pumps, which use the earth's geothermal energy to heat and cool homes. That means the Ecovillage will be nearly energy self-sufficient, generating most of its own electricity on site rather than receiving it from the grid. Ecovillage homes will also use materials and incorporate design features that will achieve extraordinary energy efficiency. It is projected that homes in the Ecovillage will draw approximately 60% less electricity from the grid than conventional homes of the same size.

⁷ The 191 unit project is based on the old model of community development in that it fails to offer any alternatives to the automobile. In contrast, reducing automobile dependence is integral to the Ecovillage. Its layout around the Village Square, connected by safe and convenient paths, will make it easy to meet local needs without getting in the car. Shuttle service to the City of St. Helena (connecting with VINE) and St. Helena Hospital will provide another easy car alternative. Electric vehicles for local trips and car sharing for longer ones are already proven to reduce traffic in other communities, and will be introduced in the Ecovillage. We can use our cars less if we design our communities with alternatives in mind.

⁸ The pre-approved project does nothing to improve public safety in Angwin; it arguably makes the community less safe by adding people without a corresponding safety contribution. In contrast, the Ecovillage incorporates (at the developer's expense) a new Sheriff's Substation, proposed for the Village Square, which will reduce response times to Angwin by many precious minutes, and will allow the Sheriff to implement a community policing program. The Ecovillage will also make Angwin more fire safe by contributing substantial funds to the Angwin

Volunteer Fire Department, developing a community-wide fire prevention and vegetation management plan, and making recycled water available for fire fighting.

⁹ State law requires both the pre-approved project and the Ecovillage to pay an impact fee to Howell Mountain School District. Although state law does not require any payment to private schools, the Ecovillage has voluntarily agreed to make a contribution – a significant contribution – to PUCE, Prep and Foothills. It is also exploring the possibility of providing funds to St. Helena High School, although the law does not require any contribution. Local schools, public and private, will receive a significant financial boost from the Ecovillage.

¹⁰ Both the pre-approved project and the Ecovillage will preserve existing Angwin businesses, but that is where the similarity ends. The 191 unit project will leave Angwin Plaza as it is. The Ecovillage proposes to enhance the local shopping experience by upgrading to Village Square. The new commercial center of Angwin will feature a small modern grocery store, featuring organic produce from the local farm, a pharmacy, deli, cafe and other local-serving businesses, alongside the familiar bank, post office and hardware store. The Village Square will include the Community/Teen Center, the proposed Sheriff's Substation, and a 20-room inn for visiting parents and relatives. It will not be necessary to travel to St. Helena nearly so often, and local dollars will stay in town. The shops will surround a grassy village green or commons, with benches and pathways, where locals can meet and a farmer's market can be held weekly.

¹¹ The Ecovillage is not only about creating a sustainable community; it is about ensuring the financial health and continuing educational mission of PUC. The sale of land for the 191 unit project will generate a relatively modest sum for the College, insufficient to enhance its endowment meaningfully, and will provide no educational benefit whatsoever. In contrast, proceeds from the Ecovillage will enable the College to build an impressive endowment, with a target figure of \$80 to \$100 million. That money will not be spent, but invested, with the income used to pay faculty salaries and provide financial aid for students. Moreover, the Ecovillage will serve as an unparalleled resource as PUC reorients its curriculum toward environmental sustainability, the next big thing in an increasingly competitive educational marketplace.